

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

DONALD C. HUTCHINS

Plaintiff

V.

CARDIAC SCIENCE, INC.

## Defendants

Civil Action: 04-30126-MAP

**DEFENDANT COMPLIENT CORPORATION'S  
REPLY BRIEF IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO REMAND**

In opposition to Compliant's Motion to Remand, Hutchins claims that the Motion to Remand is untimely. Hutchins claims that Local Rule 7.1 proscribed a 14-day period of time to file Compliant's Motion to Remand. This argument is incorrect. Local Rule 7.1 pertains to memoranda in opposition to motions filed by a party and does not govern the time for filing an affirmative motion. Instead, 28 U.S.C. Section 1447, provides that a party has 30 days from the filing of a Notice of Removal to file a Motion to Remand.

Hutchins claims that the time for Compliant’s Motion to Remand began to run as of the filing of his improper “Motion for Removal.” At the January 4, 2006 hearing, counsel for Compliant argued on the record, contrary to Hutchins’ assertion, in opposition to his “Motion for Removal.” At the January 4, 2006 hearing, the Court explained that, among other things, that a motion is not the proper vehicle by which to remove a case from state to federal court. Thereafter, on January 5, 2006, Hutchins filed his alleged “Amended” Notice of Removal (which was not amended at all). Amended or not, Compliant’s time to file a Motion to Remand did not

begin to run until January 6, 2006 and, further, did not lapse until February 6, 2006. Accordingly, Compliant's Motion to Remand, filed on January 30, 2006 is, indeed, timely. Compliant respectfully requests that it be granted.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ John J. Egan

JOHN J. EGAN (151680)  
EGAN, FLANAGAN & COHEN, P.C.  
PO Box 9035  
67 Market Street  
Springfield, MA 01102-9035  
(216) 622-8200  
FAX (216) 241-0816

WILLIAM E. COUGHLIN (0010874)  
COLLEEN MORAN O'NEIL (0066576)  
CALFEE, HALTER & GRISWOLD LLP  
1400 McDonald Investment Center  
800 Superior Avenue  
Cleveland, Ohio 44114  
(216) 622-8200  
(216) 241-0816 (facsimile)

Attorneys for Compliant Corporation

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

A copy of the foregoing Defendant Compliant Corporation's Reply Brief in Support of Motion to Remand is being served by operation of the Court's electronic filing system and First Class United States Mail this 17<sup>th</sup> day of February, 2006, upon:

Donald C. Hutchins  
1047 Longmeadow Street  
Longmeadow, Massachusetts 01106

Paul H. Rothschild, Esq.  
Bacon & Wilson, P.C.  
33 State Street  
Springfield, MA 01103

And

Randall T. Skaar, Esq.  
Scott G. Ulbrich  
Patterson, Thunte, Skaar & Christensen,  
P.A.  
4800 IDS Center  
80 South 8th Street  
Minneapolis, MN 55402-2100

Attorneys for Defendant Cardiac Science,  
Inc.

/s/ John J. Egan  
One of the attorneys for Compliant  
Corporation